# **EXHIBIT 2**

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
2	WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK		
3			
4	BLACK LOVE RESISTS IN THE RUST, ET AL., INDIVIDUALLY AND ON BEHALF OF A CLASS OF ALL OTHERS SIMILARLY SITUATED,		
5			
6	Plaintiffs,		
7	-vs- 1:18-cv-00719-CCR		
8	CITY OF BUFFALO, N.Y., ET AL.,		
9			
10	Defendants.		
11			
12	EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL		
13	OF MAYOR BYRON BROWN		
14	APPEARING REMOTELY FROM		
15	ERIE COUNTY, NEW YORK		
16			
17	November 6th, 2023		
18	At 9:00 a.m.		
19	Pursuant to notice		
20			
21			
22	REPORTED BY:		
23	Rebecca L. DiBello, RPR, CSR(NY)		

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

- 1 approximately a half an hour.
- Q. Okay. And when did that meeting take place?
- 3 A. Last week.
- Q. Have you reviewed any documents or materials to prepare for this deposition?
  - A. I read the complaint.
    - Q. By complaint you mean the complaint in this matter, captioned Franklin v Buffalo, New York?
- 10 A. Yes.

6

7

8

9

- Q. And did you discuss today's deposition with anybody other than your attorney?
- 13 A. No, I did not.
- Q. You're currently the Mayor of the City of Buffalo?
- 16 A. Yes, I am.
- 0. You first took office in 2006 I believe?
- 18 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. What term is this as far as your service as mayor?
- 21 A. This is the fifth four-year term.
- Q. Okay. Are you planning to seek another?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

majority White neighborhood.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. And would you agree that the East Side of Buffalo is a majority Black neighborhood?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. I would agree that the East Side of Buffalo is a majority Black neighborhood.
- Q. What forces have contributed to racial segregation in Buffalo during your time as mayor?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form. You can answer.

- A. I don't know if the forces that have contributed to racial segregation occurred during my time as mayor. As I indicated, those forces are decades old. Bank redlining, objections to desegregation of schools back in the 70s, so a number of things that contributed to segregation, decades and decades before I came mayor.
- Q. Would you agree that the trend of segregation nonetheless persists to this day?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

A. What is the last part of your question? That

# -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -1 the trends what? 2 Q. Persist to this day? 3 MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form. 4 A. There is still a presence of segregation in 5 the City to this day. Q. Buffalo also has public housing, correct? 6 7 A. Yes, it does. 8 O. And that's housing that administered by the Buffalo Municipal Housing Authority or BMHA? 9 A. That's correct. 10 11 Q. And BMHA housing is income restricted? A. Yes, it is. 12 13 Q. So you have to be living in poverty to be 14 eliqible? 15 Objection to form. MR. SAHASRABUDHE: 16 A. You have to be low income generally to live in 17 Buffalo municipal housing. Q. Okay. And residents of BMHA properties are 18 19 predominantly racial minorities in Buffalo, 20 correct? 21 MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form. 22 A. That's correct.

Q. I'd like to turn to your duties as mayor.

23

would you describe your chief responsibilities?

- A. My chief responsibilities are to prepare the City budget, to manage the various departments of the City of Buffalo and to deliver city services to the residents of the community.
- Q. Okay. Now, we'll get into that momentarily, but as mayor is it fair to say that you're also a policymaking official for Buffalo?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. It's fair to say that I am a policymaking official.
  - Q. And what does that mean in your eyes?

    MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
  - A. What that means is developing programs and initiatives that help to deliver services to the residents of the community and to introduce legislation that can be reviewed and approved, passed by the City Council.
  - Q. Got it. As mayor are you also able to issue executive orders?
- A. Yes, I am.
- Q. Are you able to propose new policy?

A. Yes, I am.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Are you able to approve or veto the City budget?
- A. Yes, I am.
  - Q. Are you able to defend the City in litigation when the City is sued or officials are sued?

    MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

    Go ahead.
  - A. The City Corporation Counsel is the attorney for the municipal corporation.
  - Q. Do you have a role in lawsuits that are filed against the City as far as, for instance, determining whether a settlement should be approved?
- MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- 16 A. I do not.
  - Q. Okay. And in areas like executive orders is there anyone who can veto your decision?
    - A. I have not proposed a lot of executive orders.

      The executive orders that I have proposed have not been objected to.
  - Q. Okay. Now, as mayor do you have any responsibilities related to municipal

1 agencies?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. I have management responsibilities with municipal agencies.
  - Q. When you say management authorities what do you mean?
  - A. So ultimately the mayor is the chief executive officer of the administration of City government and I manage the work of the commissioners that manage the various departments of City government.
- Q. Okay. Does that include the Buffalo Police Department?
- 14 A. Yes, it does.
- Q. Does it include the Buffalo Traffic Violations
  Authority or BTVA?
- 17 A. Yes, it does.
- Q. Does that include the Commission on Citizens
  Rights and Community Relations?
- 20 A. Yes, it does.
- Q. Does it include the Buffalo Municipal Housing
  Authority Commission?
- 23 A. No, not directly. I appoint commissioners to

- the Buffalo Municipal Housing Authority.
- Q. Okay. So for the BMHA you have the authority to appoint commissioners, correct?
  - A. Yes, that's correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Q. But with respect to the other agencies you just described, you have broader managerial powers?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. Yes. I have management authority over other City departments.
- Q. Okay. And in the case of the Buffalo Police Department, your authority extends beyond merely appointing commissioners?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. Well, we work to set policy. I review recommendations from the commissioners.
- Q. And that includes the commissioner for the Buffalo Police Department or BPD?
- A. That's correct.
  - Q. Okay. And does that also include -- do you also have the ability to review policies related to the BTVA?
- 23 A. I do.

- Q. And is there someone from -- to the extent that the BPD does receive overtime year in and year out, is there anyone from your office involved in approving those requests?
- A. That would be reviewed by the police commissioner and the police commissioner's management staff and there would be review by the finance commissioner and the Department of Finance.
- Q. Okay. So the mayor's office is not involved in administering overtime requests?
- 12 A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

21

22

- Q. Do you have the ability to veto or disapprove overtime requests by the Department?
- 15 A. I do not.
- Q. Are you able to issue executive orders to the Buffalo Police Department?
- MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.
- A. I could issue executive orders for the police department.
  - Q. Okay. Are there any instances where you have?

    MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.
- A. Not that I recall at this time.

- Q. Are you able to issue directives short of executive orders?
- A. Am I able to issue directives?
  - Q. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- A. Well, I certainly am able to speak to the police commissioner and share concerns with the commissioner, absolutely.
- Q. Okay. Can you instruct the commissioner to engage in certain police activities?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. I generally do not direct the police commissioner to engage in different police activities.
- Q. Is that an ability that you have, however?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.
  - A. It is not the way I manage, so I would say no.
  - Q. Is there anything that restricts you from issuing directives to the Department commissioners?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

A. So the police commissioner and the management staff of the police commissioners are public safety professionals trained in providing

- public safety, so I do not issue directives to the police commissioner in that way.
- Q. So you referred to a managerial style just a minute ago with respect to the BPD. Do you recall that?
- A. Yes, I do.

Q. So is your managerial style to defer to the BPD commissioner when it comes to the decisions about police activity?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. I, of course, listen to the recommendations of the police commissioner and the commissioner's management staff.
- Q. Can you think of an instance where you have disapproved any decisions that a police commissioner has made?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

A. I would not take the position of disapproving.

I would look over proposals, I would go over situations, offer my concerns or recommendations for the concerns of the community and then the commissioner and the commissioner's management team would make

-MAYOR	$DXD \cap XI$	$DD \cap DD$
MAIUR	DIRUN	BRUWN

decisions.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. How many police commissioners have there been over the BPD during your time as mayor?
- A. I believe that answer would be four.
- Q. Can you remind us of their names?
- A. H. McCarthy Gibson, Daniel Derenda, Byron Lockwood and Joseph Gramaglia.
- Q. Were you responsible for appointing each of those individuals to their position as commissioner?
- A. Yes.
  - Q. And how did you determine each of those individuals qualified to serve as commissioner for the BPD?
    - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
  - A. Interviews, reviewing resumes, reviewing experience and training in law enforcement.
    - Q. In the case of Commissioner Derenda, Lockwood and Gramaglia, did you perform reference checks?
      - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
    - A. All of those individuals had long tenures in the police department spanning several

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

being taken completely off guard about something that Commissioner Derenda, Lockwood or Gramaglia were doing that affected the BPD because you were never informed?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. I would say that there were not those instances.
- Q. So generally speaking, Commissioners Derenda,

  Lockwood and Gramaglia kept you well-informed

  about the BPD's activities?
- A. That is correct.

Q. During their tenure as commissioners was there anything that Commissioners Derenda, Lockwood or Gramaglia did with respect to the BPD that you strongly disagreed with?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. No. There were not instances of the management of Commissioners Derenda, Lockwood and Gramaglia that I strongly disagreed with.
- Q. As mayor have you approved of the policing decisions that Commissioners Derenda, Lockwood and Gramaglia have made in the City of Buffalo?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. I think those commissioners have made good policing decisions based on the needs of this community.
- Q. There's nothing that you've instructed them to discontinue, for instance?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. Again, the commissioners would talk about police strategies and tactics. I'd give my recommendations, my insight, but those decisions would be made by the commissioners.
- Q. So there's nothing with respect to police initiatives under Commissioners Derenda, Lockwood or Gramaglia that you had recommended be discontinued or concerns you have?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

A. Again, I would look at police initiatives, strategy, tactics. I would give my thoughts, my ideas, my concerns, my praise and in some instances, but certainly would leave it to the commissioners to make the final determination, recommendation on the discontinuance of any policing initiative knowing that periodically

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

policing strategy and tactics are varied in our department.

Q. Okay. But with respect to initiatives, policing initiatives that Commissioners Derenda, Lockwood and Gramaglia engaged in as commissioner, you reviewed and approved their decisions ultimately?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. The commissioners manage the Department. And I don't try to insert myself into the decisions of the various commissioners. We talk about those decisions. They explain those decisions to me. I give feedbacks, concerns and recommendations, but ultimately the management of our various departments is the responsibility of the commissioners.
- Q. How do you reconcile that approach with your duty as mayor to ensure that city officials follow the law?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

A. I think that by meeting frequently with commissioners and discussing the goals, mission and objectives of our government that

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

-MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

is a way of doing that. By them reporting out the activities of their departments and the priorities of their departments in line with the goals, mission and objectives of the government overall, that is a way of providing oversight, of providing guidance and to some degree monitoring the actions and activities of our commissioners.

- Q. You agree that as mayor you have a role to monitor the activities of the BPD commissioners?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. Again, my management role extends to every commissioner including the BPD commissioner and I take that role very seriously and meet frequently with our commissioners.
- Q. And so when -- given the extent to which you collaborate when the BPD commissioners ask it's with the approval of your office. Is that fair?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. Major policy decisions that BPD commissioners are making, I am aware of those decisions.

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

Q. Daniel Derenda, commissioner of police, informed you that the BPD intended to use checkpoints as part of a plan to address gang violence, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. The primary purpose of checkpoints was vehicle and traffic interdiction. The Strike Force was a unit that was a proactive unit that was designed to reduce crime in the City and the traffic checkpoint moved from place to place in the City as did the Strike Force.
- Q. I'm sorry, Mayor Brown. We must be misunderstanding each other because you repeated your previous answer without any consideration of the question I asked.

So why don't I pull up a document and we'll mark it as Exhibit 5 for this deposition. It was produced in discovery as COB 226141. Let me know if it's large enough for you to see.

- A. I can see the top of the document.
- Q. It's two pages. I'm showing you the first page. Do you see that this is an email from

- A. I know that there have been some concerns raised about the checkpoints.
- Q. Do you recall attending a forum at Mt. Olive

  Baptist Church concerning policing in Buffalo?
  - A. I have attended a lot of forums at Mt. Olive

    Baptist Church. I don't recall specifically

    what format you might be describing.
  - Q. Do you recall a forum that was held in conjunction with the Commission on Citizens Rights and Community Relations in 2014, December 2014, at the Mount Olive Baptist Church where you were present?
- A. I don't recall.

- Q. Do you recall there being research completed by the University of Buffalo concerning the checkpoint program in the City of Buffalo?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.
- A. I don't recall.
  - Q. Mayor Brown, I'd like to direct you to a document. I think we're up to Exhibit 16.

    I'm marking as Exhibit 16 the following document that was produced in discovery as COB 082897 and it's links to an article in the

## -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -1 Daily Public. 2 Mr. Brown, are you able -- Mayor Brown, 3 are you able to see this cover email? 4 A. Yes. It's an email from Byron Brown sent to 5 members of the police department. Including the deputy commissioner at the time? 6 Q. 7 That's correct. 8 It's sending an article from the Daily Public? Ο. 9 Α. Yes. The Daily Public is a news source that you at 10 Ο. 11 least occasionally review? MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form. 12 13 A. The Daily Public I guess was a news source at 14 that time. I don't recall it, so I doubt it still even exists. 15 16 Q. Okay. As I proceed you see -- you have the 17 article that was disseminated by you? 18 A. Right. 19

- Q. On July 13th, 2015 called "Checkpoint, Buffalo Police Practices Questioned"?
- A. Yes, I see it.

20

21

Q. I'll try to adjust it. There are advertisements on the right side.

some.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Q. Okay. And you reviewed this map back in 2016 when this article first came about?

-MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. I don't know if I reviewed the map, but obviously I saw the article and I forwarded the article.
- Q. This map, what does it indicate regarding checkpoint locations and their geographic distribution?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. The map shows that there were a good number of checkpoints in the northeast section of the city, some in the west, some in the north, some in the central city, some in the southern portion of the city.
- Q. Can you see that right on -- in the article it describes where 60 of the checkpoints took place?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

A. I do see that comment in the article that more than 60 checkpoints across 46 locations. I did just read that, yes.

Q. And did you see that all but eight of them according to this article occurred on Buffalo's predominantly African-American East Side?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. I see that comment according to that article.
- Q. But Mayor Brown -- and I'll stop sharing now.

  Data concerning checkpoint locations exists

  within the BPD, correct?
- A. That's correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

19

20

21

22

23

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Object to the form.

- Q. Have you had the opportunity to review that data?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. I would assume, yes, I have reviewed the data.
- Q. And isn't it true that BPD checkpoint location data confirms the checkpoints were predominantly on the East Side?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. From the information that I just read it looks like a lot of the checkpoints were on the East Side.
- Q. Okay. Are you aware of any data that

contradicts that the East Side was where BPD checkpoints were primarily located?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Object to the form.

- A. From what I've been presented with today I see no data that contradicts that the East Side was where many of the checkpoints took place.
- Q. Now, Mayor Brown, since you've had the opportunity to review the complaint in this case, are you familiar with -- and this will be Brown Exhibit 17 I believe, the police checkpoints map that was filed in connection with this case depicting checkpoint locations between January, 2013 and June, 2017.
- A. Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Is this a map that you've seen before?
- 16 A. I don't recall the map.
  - Q. Okay. Do you see that it indicates by color how many checkpoints occurred in a given geographic location?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. Looking at the map, I do see a color coding indicating where checkpoints took place.
- Q. Is this map, Mayor Brown, consistent with the

prior map indicating that checkpoints were predominantly on the East Side of Buffalo?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. This map does look consistent with the other map that you just showed me.
- Q. Okay. Now, Mayor Brown, going back to Brown
  Exhibit 16, you forwarded the article in the
  Daily Public to Daniel Derenda, Byron Lockwood
  and others, correct?
- A. Yes, that's correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- Q. Why did you forward the article to this group of BPD officials?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Object to the form.
  - A. My view is that I wanted to make sure that what we were doing was being done properly. I wanted to see if the article was accurate and to get more information.
    - Q. Did you request any information from the BPD officials that you contacted?
    - A. I was briefed by BPD officials.
  - Q. What did they brief you on?
- A. Again, the briefing was that there was no targeting of the East Side, that our traffic

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

East Side of Buffalo?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. There was an intersection of different missions, so the response to complaints about vehicle safety and vehicle operation, speeding, loud music, intersected with the operation of the Strike Force to address overall crime concerns and the requests from citizens to address shootings, homicides, gang violence, drug dealing.
- Q. How were the checkpoints used to address drug dealers?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. Well, in the intersection of the vehicle and traffic enforcement when vehicles were stopped individuals were found with illegal guns in vehicles, individuals were found with drugs in vehicles and we did see a pattern of crime going down in parts of the city.
- Q. Mayor Brown, were the checkpoints designed to only stop motorists who were suspected of being drug dealers?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

- A. No. The checkpoints as setup were designed for traffic safety and as motorists went through the checkpoints all motorists were stopped. In fact, I was stopped at a checkpoint.
- Q. So the way the checkpoints were designed there was no probable cause required to believe that someone had committed a crime in order to be stopped, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. Well, for the vehicle and traffic safety issues there were license plate readers so officers were able to determine if vehicles were licensed, if they were registered, if there were crime issues associated with the vehicles.
- Q. Mayor Brown, it's your testimony that license plate readers were used at every checkpoint that the BPD administered between January, 2013 and June, 2017?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form. Go ahead.

A. I don't know if license plate readers were

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

used at every checkpoint, but I know that they were used at some of the checkpoints.

Q. Mayor Brown, is your testimony that only cars that returned a hit on a license plate reader were forced to go through the checkpoints that BPD erected?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. No. That is not my testimony and I have testified that even my vehicle was stopped in a checkpoint so, no, not only those vehicles that produced hits on license plate readers.
- Q. Got it. Now, Mayor Brown, earlier you testified, and let me know if I'm mistaken, that -- well, let me ask you this question.

So when you were stopped at the checkpoint was there probable cause for your stop?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

A. Counselor, I sure hope not. But when I was stopped I was going through the checkpoint.

An officer came to the window and saw that I was driving with a police officer and that I was in the car and as many vehicles in that

#### -MAYOR BYRON BROWN -

traffic safety, again intersecting with the secondary purpose of community safety that the Strike Force was working on and at this point, as I mentioned, the police department varies tactics periodically and checkpoints are no longer being conducted in the City of Buffalo.

Q. However, you did approve of the checkpoint program as it was administered, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. The checkpoint program as it was proposed and administered I did support at the time.
- Q. You've never issued any directives prohibiting the checkpoint programs from continuing as it previously did?
- A. I have not issued any directives prohibiting the checkpoint program from continuing.
- Q. And the BPD has not issued any policy that would prohibit the checkpoints from being resumed as previous?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

A. Again, BPD and primarily commissioners of the police department vary policing strategies and tactics periodically and the checkpoint

1 STATE OF NEW YORK) 2 COUNTY OF ERIE 3 4 I, Rebecca Lynne DiBello, CSR, RPR, Notary 5 Public, in and for the County of Erie, State of New York, do hereby certify: 6 7 That the witness whose testimony appears hereinbefore was, before the commencement of 8 their testimony, duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth; that said testimony was taken pursuant 9 to notice at the time and place as herein set forth; that said testimony was taken down by me 10 and thereafter transcribed into typewriting, 11 and I hereby certify the foregoing testimony is a full, true and correct transcription of my shorthand notes so taken. 12 13 I further certify that I am neither counsel for nor related to any party to said action, 14 nor in anyway interested in the outcome thereof. 15 16 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto 17 subscribed my name and affixed my seal this 19th day of November, 2023. 18 19 Les I D'Bello 20 21 Rebecca Lynne DiBello, CSR (NY) Notary Public - State of New York 22 No. 01D14897420 Qualified in Erie County 23 My commission expires 5/11/2027